February 14, 2011

Pigeon Lake Rehabilitation & Protection District
50 10th Street
Clintonville, WI 54929

Dear Sir(s):

This acknowledges receipt of your DNR permit application to place a recirculator structure on the bed of the Fairway Lake area of Pigeon Lake in the City of Clintonville, Waupaca County. This letter contains important information regarding your permit application, so please read it carefully.

In accordance with state law, this letter is notification that your permit application is incomplete, and that you must submit additional information. The following additional information is necessary for Department staff to determine if your proposed project will meet the standards specified in state statutes and administrative rules.

1. Provide a detailed bathymetric map of the current conditions on Fairway Lake indicating surface water and bed elevations beginning at the culvert crossing under Green Tree Road south to, and including, the channel between Fairway Lake and main body of Pigeon Lake.

2. Provide sediment analysis of a minimum of two core samples; one taken in the shallow portion of the lake and one at the deepest part of Fairway Lake. These sediment cores shall be analyzed to determine overall general composition/particle size distribution (i.e. percent sand, silt and clay), total phosphorus and percent organic content.

3. Provide a review of the potential for the recirculator to resuspend bed materials based on shear stress associated with the manufacturer’s designed pumping and circulation rates. You must be able to show that you can operate the equipment without resuspending bed material. This review shall be stamped by a licensed Professional Engineer.

4. Provide an analysis of the following water quality parameters of Fairway Lake: pH, total phosphorus, total suspended solids and dissolved oxygen. The dissolved oxygen shall be determined at the surface and near the bottom of Fairway Lake.

5. Provide an aquatic macrophyte study based on the Point-Intercept Method, or similar, and include a species list as well as a map.

6. Provide a detailed long-term monitoring plan that addresses your intentions for water quality, macrophytes, dissolved oxygen, percent organics in the sediment and bathymetry. This plan shall indicate how you intend to assess the success or failure of your project and provide a specific timeline of operation.

Please submit the requested information to me as soon as possible because we cannot proceed with processing your application until it is determined to be complete. Please be sure to note any additions or alterations to the project that are different from the original permit application. This is also an opportunity for you to explain how your project will avoid impacts to public rights including, but not limited to, all types of water navigation and recreation, fish and wildlife populations, natural scenic beauty and water quality.
The scientific research regarding the efficacy and limitations of this type of technology to address the concerns of residents around Pigeon Lake and specifically the Fairway Lake area, indicates that your proposal has a high probability of not meeting your desired objectives and expectations (copies of these references are available upon request). It may actually make the problem worse.

The Department is concerned with the expenditure of time and money on a technology that may not provide the relief that is being proposed by the use of the recirculator. Please be aware that the Department supports the District's and Community's desire to improve water quality, fishing and other recreational uses on Pigeon Lake. It is the Department's opinion that these goals can be achieved by less expensive and scientifically proven techniques.

If I do not hear from you or receive the additional information identified in the attached checklists within 45 days, I will assume you are no longer interested in the project and will dismiss your application.

Please note that once your permit application is determined to be complete, the Department cannot refund your permit fee. We will review your proposal and issue a permit decision, unless you request in writing that your permit application be withdrawn. If your permit application is withdrawn before it is considered complete, you will be refunded your application processing fee.

If you have any questions about the information requested, please call me at (715) 526-4232 or email at scott.koehnke@wisconsin.gov.

Sincerely,

Scott Koehnke
Water Management Specialist

cc: Eric Norton – COE
    Jeff Henneman – Zoning
    Todd Wippermann – Warden
    Lisa Kuss – City Administrator
    Rick Stoll – NER
    Rob McLennan – NER
    Ted Johnson – Water Resources
    Al Niebur – Fisheries
    Jake Fries – Wildlife
    Dave Stertz – Water Management Engineer
    WZ - file